

**Butler County Board of Elections
Regular Board Meeting Minutes
November 18, 2024**

The Butler County Board of Elections met on Monday, November 18, 2024, at 1:00 p.m., for a regular meeting. Roll call was taken, and present were Chairman Frank Cloud, Member Todd Hall, Member Chris Wunnenberg III, Director Nicole Unzicker, Deputy Director Eric Corbin, Public Relations Specialist Katie Robinson and one member of the public.

Member Wunnenberg lead the pledge of allegiance.


Chairman Cloud presented Document 1, Bills. Member Wunnenberg moved to approve the bills on Document 1; seconded by Member Hall. Member Hall asked about a payment to Graphic Village. The Directors explained that the listed charge is for the NCOA mailing. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	absent
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.



**Regular Board Meeting Bills
Butler County Board of Elections**


Chairman


Director

November 18, 2024
Date

Grand Total \$ 53,922.36

Account / Vendor / Description	Amount
520000 - OFFICE SUPPLIES	
ODP BUSINESS SOLUTIO	
OFFICE SUPPLIES	\$9.49
ODP BUSINESS SOLUTIO Total	\$9.49
520000 - OFFICE SUPPLIES Total	
	\$9.49
521000 - POSTAGE	
PITNEY BOWES BANK I	
POSTAGE RESERVE ACCT 18850	\$14,000.00
PITNEY BOWES BANK I Total	\$14,000.00
521000 - POSTAGE Total	
	\$14,000.00
524000 - GAS/FUEL/OIL	
VOYAGER FLEET SYSTEM	
OCT FUEL SUPPLES	\$41.59
VOYAGER FLEET SYSTEM Total	\$41.59
524000 - GAS/FUEL/OIL Total	
	\$41.59
525100 - SOFTWARE/HARDWARE EQUIP	
TENEX SOFTWARE SOLUT	
FOUR E-POLL BOOKS	\$2,648.00
TENEX SOFTWARE SOLUT Total	\$2,648.00
525100 - SOFTWARE/HARDWARE EQUIP Total	
	\$2,648.00
529000 - OTHER MATERIALS/SUPPLIES	
4IMPRINT INC	
2000 PEO APPRECIATION TOTES	\$2,556.52
4IMPRINT INC Total	\$2,556.52
AMAZON CAPITAL SERVI	
ELECTION SUPPLIES	\$704.78
WAREHOUSE SUPPLIES	\$232.74
AMAZON CAPITAL SERVI Total	\$937.52
BERNS GARDEN CENTER	
SECURITY PLANTER SUPPLIES	\$141.82
BERNS GARDEN CENTER Total	\$141.82
DOMINION VOTING SYST	

Bills

Account / Vendor / Description	Amount
CLEANING SHEET	\$24.77
DOMINION VOTING SYST Total	\$24.77
HOME DEPOT	
SECURITY PLANTER SUPPLIES	\$50.90
HOME DEPOT Total	\$50.90
JOS BERNING PRINTING	
WINDOW ENVELOPES	\$1,185.00
SIGNS	\$980.00
JOS BERNING PRINTING Total	\$2,165.00
KIRSTEN KALUGYER	
SECURITY PLANTER SUPPLIES	\$125.97
KIRSTEN KALUGYER Total	\$125.97
MENARDS	
WAREHOUSE SUPPLIES	\$116.40
MENARDS Total	\$116.40
MILLER CONSULTATIONS	
ELECTION SUPPLIES	\$107.60
MILLER CONSULTATIONS Total	\$107.60
ONLINE LABELS LLC	
ELECTION LABELS SUPPLIES	\$344.29
ONLINE LABELS LLC Total	\$344.29
THE MILLCRAFT PAPER	
ELECTION SUPPLIES	\$399.50
THE MILLCRAFT PAPER Total	\$399.50
ULINE INC	
WAREHOUSE SUPPLIES	\$648.48
ULINE INC Total	\$648.48
US BANK	
SNACKS SUPPLIES	\$678.79
US BANK Total	\$678.79
529000 - OTHER MATERIALS/SUPPLIES Total	\$8,297.56
530000 - EQUIP/BLDG MAIN & REPAIR SVC	
QUADIENT INC	
FOLDING MACHINE REPAIR	\$520.00
QUADIENT INC Total	\$520.00
530000 - EQUIP/BLDG MAIN & REPAIR SVC Total	\$520.00
530075 - TECHNOLOGY SUPPORT	
ESSVR LLC	
OCT VOTER FILE SUPPORT	\$7,981.67
ESSVR LLC Total	\$7,981.67
VERIZON WIRELESS	
SEPTEMEBER WIRELESS SUPPORT	\$25.08
VERIZON WIRELESS Total	\$25.08
530075 - TECHNOLOGY SUPPORT Total	\$8,006.75

Bills

Account / Vendor / Description	Amount
530310 - RENTAL - EQUIPMENT	
GREAT AMERICA FINANC	
COPIERS 4TH QTR RENTAL LEASE	\$1,337.97
GREAT AMERICA FINANC Total	\$1,337.97
530310 - RENTAL - EQUIPMENT Total	\$1,337.97
536000 - OTHER CONTRACT SVCS	
CAROL MEADE	
BACKGROUND CHECK FINGERPRINTING	\$5.00
CAROL MEADE Total	\$5.00
COX FIRST MEDIA	
AD, DEADLINE TO REGISTER	\$350.00
COX FIRST MEDIA Total	\$350.00
GRAPHIC VILLAGE LLC	
15, 000 2024 NCOAS PRINTING AND MAILED	\$5,422.62
GRAPHIC VILLAGE LLC Total	\$5,422.62
GREGORY MYERS	
BACKGROUND CHECK REIMBURSEMENT	\$35.88
GREGORY MYERS Total	\$35.88
KARA HAUBNER	
BACKGROUND CHECK FINGERPRINTING	\$10.00
KARA HAUBNER Total	\$10.00
MILLENNIUM BUSINESS	
FLEX COPIES	\$1,042.69
MILLENNIUM BUSINESS Total	\$1,042.69
ROBERT HALF INTERNAT	
TEMP AGENCY	\$8,182.45
ROBERT HALF INTERNAT Total	\$8,182.45
SECURITY LOCK COMPAN	
REPLACE AND INSTALL CONFERENCE LOCKS	\$129.00
SECURITY LOCK COMPAN Total	\$129.00
STATE OF OHIO TREASU	
ELECTION CLERKS BACKGROUND CHECKS	\$44.00
STATE OF OHIO TREASU Total	\$44.00
TRAK STAFFING SERVIC	
TEMP AGENCY	\$2,921.88
TRAK STAFFING SERVIC Total	\$2,921.88
US BANK	
PEO LMS	\$917.48
US BANK Total	\$917.48
536000 - OTHER CONTRACT SVCS Total	\$19,061.00
Grand Total	\$53,922.36

Chairman Cloud presented Document 2, the minutes of the October 10, 2024, meeting. Member Wunnenberg moved to approve the October 10, 2024, meeting minutes on Document 2; seconded by Chairman Cloud. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	absent
Member Hall	abstain
Member Wunnenberg	yea

Majority in favor; motion carried.

Member Wunnenberg introduced Document 3, the minutes of the October 15, 2024, meeting. Member Wunnenberg moved to approve the October 15, 2024, meeting minutes on Document 3; seconded by Chairman Cloud. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	absent
Member Hall	abstain
Member Wunnenberg	yea

Majority in favor; motion carried.

Member Hall made a motion to approve the meeting minutes from November 4, 2024; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. There was a short discussion about the meeting date at the top of Document 4. The date on the top of the minutes will be updated to include both the 4th and 5th prior to printing and signing the official minutes. Member Hall moved to rescind his previous motion; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	absent
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

Member Wunnenberg made a motion to approve the Meeting Minutes of the November 4th and 5th meeting; seconded by Member Hall. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	absent
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

Director Unzicker noted there that the office has not received any directives, advisories or memorandums.

Under New Business, Director Unzicker presented Document 5, Validate and Invalidate Provisional Ballots Cast in the November 5, 2024, General Election. Director Unzicker stated there are a total of 5,268 provisional ballots. She then explained there are three provisional ballots where the Board has discretion to validate or invalidate.

Director Unzicker explained the first voter, Isabelle M. Wright, cast a provisional ballot on October 25, 2024, because on October 23, 2024, her sister was incorrectly processed under Isabelle's name by one of the temporary staff members. The staff member did not verify the signature and selected the wrong record. Corrective action was taken right away which instructed all temporary staff members to get a full-time staff member to verify the correct record was selected. Director Unzicker said her, and Deputy Director Corbin researched this provisional ballot and concluded the wrong voter record was selected. All the other information on the provisional envelope meets the requirements outlined in Chapter 8 of the Ohio Election Officials Manual and R.C. 3505.183. Member Hall moved to validate the ballot for Isabelle M. Wright; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	absent
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

Director Unzicker explained the next voter, Duc T. Vu, is a very similar situation which happened prior to the process change from the previously discussed voter. This voter's record was selected incorrectly when a relative living at the same address came in to vote. The directors were able to determine that the wrong voter

was selected and all the other information on the provisional envelope meets the requirements outlined in Chapter 8 of the Ohio Election Officials Manual and R.C. 3505.183. Member Hall moved to validate the ballot for Duc T. Vu; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	absent
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

Director Unzicker introduced the last voter for Board discretion, Matthew Corder, who wrote the incorrect day in the date of birth field. She then explained that the Board can vote to validate the ballot if they so choose because of the following exception from the Ohio Elections officials Manual.

“If the affirmation statement contains the voter’s date of birth but the month and day are different from the month and day in the Statewide Voter Registration Database, the board must reject the provisional ballot unless: 1) the voter’s date of birth in the database is 1/1/1800; or 2) the board of elections finds by a vote of at least three of its members that the voter has met all of the other requirements of RC 3505.183(B)(3).” Ohio Secretary of State Directive 2023-08

Member Hall moved to validate the ballot for Matthew Corder; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	absent
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

Director Unzicker said the next item on Document 5 is the invalid provisional affirmation forms. The total number of 1,612 invalid provisional ballots is broken down into multiple categories. Member Hall made a motion to invalidate the 1,612 invalid ballots as listed in Document 5; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	absent
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

Member Hall made a motion to approve the 3,656 valid provisional ballots; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	absent
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.



Provisional Ballots for Board Review
November 5, 2024, General Election
 November 18, 2024

Requirements according to EOM Chapter 8.04 and addendum to Directive 2024-22

Printed name, valid signature, date of birth*, voter's current address; and voter's statement that they have shown photo identification to the election official or completed an affidavit of religious objection, cast ballot in correct polling location, voter was a registered voter anywhere in Ohio at least 30 days before the election, determined the voter has not already requested or cast a ballot in the election.

Director Certification

The Director and Deputy Director verified on a bipartisan basis that the provisional ballots cast in the November 2024, General Election have been reviewed and the eligibility of each ballot is summarized above on this document in accordance with Ohio Secretary of State Election Official Manual Chapter 8, addendum to Directive 2024-22, and R.C. 3505.183.

Total Provisional Ballots – 5268

Director *Neil Wright*
 Deputy Director *E. Corbin*

Board Discretion

Total – 3 (these ballots are not included in the valid or invalid sections below)

Isabelle Wright: Valid ✓ Invalid _____
 Duc T Vu: Valid ✓ Invalid _____
 Matthew Corder: Valid ✓ Invalid _____

Recommended Motion:

Motion to validate or invalidate the names listed under board discretion on Document 5.

Invalid

Reason	Count
Not Registered	968
Identification	472
Wrong Polling Location	21
Signature	107
Second Vote	27
Date of Birth	5
Incomplete	6
No Printed Name	1
Out of County Invalid	5
Subtotal	1,612
Board Discretion Invalid (Write total invalid number from Board discretion section above)	<u>0</u>
Total Invalid	<u>1,612</u>

Recommended Motion:

Invalidate 1,612 Provisional ballots **not to be** included in the official canvass.

Valid

Reason	Count
Valid	3,653
Subtotal	3,653
Board Discretion Valid (Write total valid number from Board discretion section above)	<u>3</u>
Total Valid	<u>3,656</u>

Recommended Motion:

Accept 3,656 Provisional ballots **to be** included in the official canvass.

Deputy Director Corbin presented Document 6, the Post-Election Audit Criteria. Deputy Director Corbin stated the following races will be audited: President and Vice President, U.S. Senator and Representative to Congress 8th District. Deputy Director Corbin asked the Board Members to make a motion to conduct the audit by tabulators as listed in Document 6. He stated the selection of tabulators will take place on Wednesday, November 20, 2024, at 9:00 a.m. at the Board office and the audit will be conducted on Monday, December 2, 2024, at 9:00 a.m. at the Board office. If a recount is declared, then the audit will be conducted on Thursday December 5, 2024, at 9:00 a.m. Member Hall moved to select the Post-Election Audit Criteria as listed in Document 6; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll Call:
 Chairman Cloud yea

Member penska absent
Member Hall yea
Member Wunnenberg yea
All in favor; motion carried.

Under Old Business Deputy Director Corbin said he has a response for a public comment made at the Tuesday, October 15, 2024, meeting.

Deputy Director Corbin stated,

Public Comment: The early voting logic and accuracy testing has not been announced but early voting has already started.

Response: A press release was sent out on Monday, September 30, 2024, outlining the process for Logic and Accuracy Testing. The release states that Logic and Accuracy Testing will begin on Tuesday, October 1, 2024, which was prior to the beginning of early voting. It also stated that the public Logic and Accuracy Testing would take place on Friday, October 18, 2024, at 10:00 a.m.

Under the General Office Update Director Unzicker informed the Board Members that the temporary staff that has been returning each election has been a huge help and we look forward to seeing some of the new temporary staff members return in the future.

Deputy Director Corbin gave kudos to the full-time staff for working every day from October 21, 2024, through November 15, 2024, which is 26 days straight, with the last week of early voting keeping the office open from 7:30 a.m. to 7:30 p.m.

Member Hall moved to go into Executive Session to discuss personnel according to O.R.C. 121.22(G)(1) at 1:09 a.m.; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll call:

Chairman Cloud yea
Member penska absent
Member Hall yea
Member Wunnenberg yea
All in favor; motion carried.

At 1:32 p.m. Chairman Cloud stated the board is back in session.

Chairman Cloud asked if there was anyone who wanted to make a public comment, there were no comments made.

With no further business, Member Hall moved to adjourn the meeting; seconded by Member penska. Roll call:

Chairman Cloud yea
Member penska absent
Member Hall yea
Member Wunnenberg yea
All in favor; motion carried.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 01:32 p.m.

Frank Cloud, Chairman

Nicole Unzicker, Director

Todd Hall, Member

Chris Wunnenberg III, Member

ABSENT

mariann penska, Member